



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

NOT FOR PUBLICATION FILED UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS APR 30 2018 MOLLY C. DWYER, CLERK U.S. COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

ROBERT ALVARADO, No. 15-55952

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05632-PSG-VBK and

JEFFREY ANDERSON; RUDY MEMORANDUM* BARRIGAN; KEITH BERTONNEAU; JAMES BROWN; PETER BUENO; ANDREW BUESA; GEORGE BUSH II; TIMOTHY COLOMEY; DAVID CORBET; RUBEN DE LA TORRE; REBECCA GALLEGOS; ROBERT GALLEGOS; MICHAEL GANNON; ULYSSES GASCA; ALAN GILMER; MICHAEL GLENN; ANTHONY GONZALES; ROBERT GUYER; LOMA HOLLAND; LYLE KNIGHT; LORI LEE; KEVIN LOVE; NICHOLAS MILAZZO; KURT MILES; JONATHAN MILLER; JAMES MOODY; KI NAM; JOSEPH O'DONNELL; ALAN RAMIREZ; JESSE REYES; RANDY RICO; RAY RODRIGUEZ; DOUGLAS ROLLER; LISA RUEGG; TERRY RUPPEL; CATHERINE RYMSZA-LEON; JOHNNY SANCHEZ; SUCHA SINGH, Jr.; AARON SKIVE; MICHAEL SLEDD; TANZA SMALLS; SANDRA SMITH; RONALD STAMPS; STEVEN STEAR; LANE STERLING; JOHN STIEGLITZ;

* This disposition is not appropriate for publication and is not precedent except as provided by Ninth Circuit Rule 36-3.

JOHN THOMAS; GERALD TOMIC; TONY TRUS; OMAR VELOZ; RICHARD WAAK; CHRISTOPHER WALTER; DIONNE WATTS; MICHAEL WILLIAMSON; ERIC WINDHAM; PHILLIP WRIGHT,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Philip S. Gutierrez, District Judge, Presiding



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

JASON ABNER, No. 15-55955

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05655-PA-MRW and

EDWARD ACOSTA; LUIS ALVARADO; VICTOR ALVAREZ; MICHAEL ARTEAGA; ALEXANDER BAUTISTA; ROBERT BISHOP; THOMAS BOJORQUEZ; SHANE BUA; JOHN CAMPOS; JUAN CAMPOS; FRANCISCO CARRILLO; CLAUDIA CASTRUITA; TOM CHAVEZ; JAMES CHONG; STEVE CHUNG; KIMBERLY CISCO; CHARLES CLAEYS; DIMITRIUS CONNOR; DIOSDADO CORONEL; HENRY COVARRUBIAS; LARRY COVINGTON; CARLOS DIAZ; REGGIE DICKERSON;

2

OSCAR DUENAS; AMIE EL FARRA; CARLOS ESCOBAR; FERDINAND FAUSTINO, Jr.; MICHAEL FIELDS; TONY FITZSIMMONS; MARTIN FRANCO; MICHAEL FRISENHAHN; ALEJANDRO GALVAN; FRANK GARCIA; RANDY GARCIA; MAGDALENO GOMEZ; ALBERT GONZALES; CLAUDIA GRAY; VICTOR GUTIERREZ; SEAN HART; PAUL HENDRY; DAVID HERNANDEZ; TERESA HERNANDEZ; MARK HUBERT; SAMER ISSA; JORGE JUAREZ; BRIAN KOREN; STEVEN KOTSINADELIS; R. MAGGIE LUQUIN; JAMES MARTINEZ; JOSEPH MCDOWELL; HEATHER MCLEAN; JOSE MIRELES; JAMES MUNIZ; RYAN NGUYEN; VICTOR NUNEZ; CARLOS OCEGUEDA; SAL OGAZ, Jr.; ISAIAS ORNELAS; ALFRED PASOS; MARTIN PERELLO; JOSE PEREZ; RICHARD PLATZER, Jr.; RICHARD RAMOS; CHRISTOPHER RAZO; JOSE REYES, Jr.; ALFREDO RODRIGUEZ; IRIS SANTIN; EDAN SHEKLOW; EDDIE SOLOMON; GREGORY STAATS; JUSTIN STEWART; CHARLES SURH; DARIUS TRUGMAN; HECTOR URENA; LILIA VELASCO; MATTHEW VOCKE; KEITH WASHINGTON; BART WITHEROW; EDMOND YAGUBYAN; CLIFTON YAMAMOTO; PHILIP ZALBA; EDWARD ZAMORA; SANDRA ZAMORA; CARLOS ZARAGOZA; MATTHEW ZEIGLER,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

3

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Percy Anderson,
District Judge, Presiding



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

MEGHAN AGUILAR, No. 15-55956

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05644-R-AJW and

TEDDY AMSTONE; SANG AN; TERESA ANDERSON; JOSE ARELLANO; JUAN ARENAS; MARIO ARRIZON; JOSEPH AVILA; RUBEN BANUELOS; TERRY BARCLAY; MICHAEL BARZ; WILLIAM BATISTA; CYNTHIA BELLO; RYAN BELLOWES; JULIO BENAVIDES; RONALD BERDIN; LANCE BLAKE; GINA BRACHT; DANIEL CALDERON; JORGE CERVANTES; JAIME CHACON; TODD CHANEY; ENRIQUE CHAVEZ; RICHARD COMPTON; EFRAIN CONTRERAS; MIGUEL CONTRERAS; MARTY COTWRIGHT; RAQUEL CRUZ; ROBERT DEAMER; EMILY DELPH; FRANCISCO DIAZ, Sr.; CHARLES DICKINSON; JOSEPH DOMINGUEZ; VALENTINE FLORES; TIM GALLI; ALFRED GARCIA; LISA GARCIA; STEVE GARCIA; DANIEL GERSNA; ADRIANA GONZALEZ; JAMES GOODWIN; DANA GRANT; RONALD

4

GRAY, Administrative Law Judge; MARK GRIEGO; OSCAR GUTIERREZ; IRSIE HENRY; RANDY HOFFMASTER; MICHAEL HOFMEYER; JENNIFER HOWLETT; LUIS JURADO; DOUGLAS KIRKLAND; JOHN KNIGHTON; LAURO LARRINUA; CESAR LEAL; DOUGLAS LONG; DEBBIE LOPEZ; ANDRES LUGO; PEDRO MACHUCA; EDWARD MACIEL, Jr.; LEONARDO MCKENZIE; SEAN MEADE; IGNACIO MIJARES; BILL MILLER; PAUL MILLER; MICHAEL MITCHELL; MARIA MONTOYA; BRENDA MORALES; HUGH O'GARA; JOSEPH OSEGURA; ROBERT PATERSON; EDWARD PETTEREZ; RUBEN QUINTANAR; STEVEN RALPH; MANUEL RAMIREZ; MARK REED; JOHN RICHARDSON; MICHAEL RICHARDSON; MICHAEL RIMKUNAS; MICHAEL RIPPE; EDWARD ROCHA; ROCAEL RODRIGUEZ; JOEL RUIZ; ROBERT RUIZ; ANTHONY SAENZ; DIANA SALCIDO; PAUL SANFILLIPPO; JOSE SANTIAGO; CARLOS SAVEDRA; CLAIRE SMITH; MICHAEL SMITH; ERIC SPEAR; CHARLES SPICER III; JEFFREY STAPLETON; CHRISTIAN URBINA; JAMES VENA; SHARLTON WAMPLER; MARK MASCARENO; GLORIA WOOD; CHARLES WUNDER; JAMES ZOUREK,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

5

Defendant-Appellee.



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Manuel L. Real,
District Judge, Presiding

FREDDIE ACKERLEY, No. 15-55957

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05654-JAK-JPR and

RICHARD ACOSTA; ROBERT ANDRENO; MANUEL ARZATE; WENDI BERNDT; STEVEN BEUMER; JAVIER BORREGO; ROBERT BROPHY; STEPHEN BUCHER; ALMA BURKE; HOWARD CHOY; JOHN COLLYER; VINCENT DEGLINNOCENTI; MICHAEL DIAZ; JOHN DOWNEY; KENNITH FERRO; TRACYE FIELDS; GARRETT FITZGERALD; WILLIAM FLANNERY; CHRISTOPHER FORMBY; ANTONINO GIAMBRUNO; CYNTHIA GOMEZ; GERARDO GUTIERREZ; DAVID HABIBI; SHAWN HAVICAN; JAMES HAYS, Jr.; GEORGE HOOPES; LAMONT JERRETT; MARK JOHNSON; MYRA KELLUM; DONOVAN LYONS; CATHERINE MASSEY; JAMES MCSORLEY; ANGELEAN MONTERO; GERARDO MORALES; RAMON MUNIZ; MIKE NELSON; ANTHONY OCHOA; ELPIDIO OROZCO; JERRY PADILLA; JOHN PADILLA; LEWIS PARKER; JOSEPH PELAYO; REYNALDO PEREZ, Jr.; BRIAN PRESTON; STEVEN

6

RAMIREZ; SHEILA RIZZOLO; HOWARD SILVERSTEIN; MAGE SIMERSKEY; THOMAS SMALL; CINTHIA TAPIA; FRED TREDY; JIM TUMBEIRO; ROBERT VARGAS; PAMELA VENTURA; WALTER WILLIS; BILL WILSON; JASON WITT; JOEY YANEZ; RENE ZAVALA,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

ANTHONY ACEVES, No. 15-55958

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05678-JAK-CW and

CRAIG ADAMS; FELICIA BAILEY; KENNETH BARTNICKI; JAMES BLAND; JULIE BROWNE; JULIAN CANALES; JOSE CASTELLANOS; JAMES CHONG; ROSALYN CLARK; CRYSTAL N. DAVIS; CRYSTAL NOVA DAVIS; JOYCE DAVIS; JORGE DE JESUS III; TRAVONNE DIXON; CHRISTY DONOROVICH O'DONNELL; LISA DURAN; GILBERT ESCONTRIAS; STACIE



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

FRENCH; DANIEL GARCIA; RICHARD GARIBAY; STEPHEN GORDON; PATRICIA GUESSFERD; JOEL HERNANDEZ; EMERSON HOLDER; FRANCISCO HURTADO;

7

JASON JACOBSON; MICHAEL JOLICOEUR; ROBIN JONES; MICHAEL KARATSONYI; HO KIM; KENT LAU; CELIA KOMATHY; RICHARD LARIMER; ROBERT LEWIS; CLANCY MAIHORI; GUS MARTINEZ; RICHARD MELENDEZ; HENRY MENDOZA; RODERICK MILLER; STEVE MORRIS; MARIA MORRISON; GREGORY NICHOLS; ADAM NIEBERGALL; DARYL ORDONE; JOHN PASQUARIELLO; YVETTE PERRODIN; ADRIANNA PRADO; LASHAWNA PUGH; DANIEL PUTZ; THOMAS RALPH; TED REYLAND; DOUGLAS ROACH; RICHARD RUSSELL; JAMES SANDS; SALLY SANTAMARIA; JOSEPH SATOW; ROSIBEL SMITH; LINDA THOMPSON; KYLE TOLLIVER; MICHAEL TOLMAIRE; MANUEL VIDES; SHAWNTRICE WATKINS; FELICIANO WILSON; LAURA WINDSOR; AMY WONG; ANTHONY VILARDO; MARIA YAMAMOTO; DIANA ZAMORA,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California John A. Kronstadt, District Judge, Presiding

8

FRANK AMADOR, Jr., No. 15-55959

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05671-R-AJW and

MAURICE BRUNEL; WALLACE CARR; CHRISTIAN CHRISTENSEN; JOSEPH CIANCANELLI; JEFFREY COLLADO; MARLO CROSS; GARY CUSICK; PATRICK DELANEY; NGUYEN DO; TINA GLENN; STEVEN GROSS; MAURICE HALLAUER; EDWARD HEREDIA; MARK HERNANDEZ; GARY HOLBROOK; CHARLES HOWARD; MICHAEL KILPATRICK; EDWARD KIM; STEPHANIE KRAJCHIR; TERESA LINCOLN; HECTOR LOMELIN; JOHN LONG; JAMES MACDONALD; DAVID MORALES; MICHELL NOWLEN; JOHNY ONYSHKO, Jr.; ROBERT ORLANDO; GREGORY OWENS; JEFFREY PAILET; JOHN POLAND; MARK PRECIADO; DANIEL PUTNAM; ENGELBERT QUECHENBERGER; NICHOLAS TITIRIGG; JORGE TORRES;



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

ALAN THATCHER; JOHN VACH, Jr.; PHIL WALTERS; DALE WASHBURN; BRIAN WILSON;
WILLIAM YOUNG; JEREMY YAMAMOTO,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

9

TROY ABORDO, No. 15-55960

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05640-R-AJW and

RICHARD ADAIR; STEVEN BISHOP; TIMOTHY BOHAC; OSMUND BOUILGNY; DARRYL
BROWN; JAMES CLIFFORD; JOHN COFFEY; CASEY COX; KAREN CRAWFORD; DANIEL
DAVIS; AJ DE BELLIS; VICTORIA DE BELLIS; SPREE DESHA; BERZON DISTOR; SERGIO
DRIOTEZ; CARLOS FIGUEIRA; KELENE GIBSON; CESAR GONZALEZ; RYAN ICAGAN;
SUSAN INVERNO; BILLY JOE; WILLIAM LANTZ; THOMAS LEE; GEORGE LEONARD;
RICHARD LOKEN; RAMON MARTINEZ; SCOTT MOFFITT; PABLO MONTERROSA;
RAYMONA MOUSSA; OSWALDO PEDEMONTE; RICHARD PEREZ; ROGER PEREZ; PAUL
RICCHIAZZI; DAVID RODRIGUEZ; RICK ROY; PAUL RUMER; TIMOTHY TULLY SCOTT I;
JOHN SMITH; MARK STRATTON; ANTONIO VARGAS; ROBERT VILLALOBOS; NEIL WANK;
RICKY WEBB,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

10

TYRONE ACOSTA, No. 15-55962

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05641-R-AJW and



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

MIGUEL AGUAYO; ROBERT AGUILAR; VINCENT AGUIRRE; CRAIG ALLEN; ADAM ALTAMMIRANO; FERNANDO ALVAREZ; RALPH ALVAREZ; MIGUEL ARAMBULA; LEONARD AVILA; MARIAN BAUSELY; MICHAEL BELMONTE; RIGO BONILLA; BARRY BOTTAI; INGE BOWMAN; RALPH CAMARILLO; DANIEL CAMPBELL; MARK CAMPBELL; GIL CARDINEZ; SANDRA CARLISLE; JOHN CASTILLO; FEDERICO CELIS; JOHN CHILSTROM; JIN CHO; ALFONSO CISNEROS; HENRY COLEBROOKE; JOSE CONTRERAS; VIC CORELLA; ROBERT COSNER; KRIS DAVIS; JOSE DE LEON; LUIS DELACRUZ; ALFREDO DELGADO; BLANCA DESORMAUX; EDDIE DIAZ; JOSEPH DUDAS; ROBERT DUKE; CORINNE ERNST; GISSELLE ESPINOZA; DONALD ESTRADA; JOSE FERRERIA; JEREMY FINK; PAUL FLOGE; MICHAEL P. FLYNN; MICHAEL R. FLYNN; AARON FOUGERE; RANDOLPH FUKUI; RAYMOND GALLUCCIO; ELMER GIBSON; ALICIA GILMER; ROBERT GOLDEN; MICHAEL GOMEZ; FIDEL GONZALEZ; JENNIFER GRASSO; CHRISTOPHER GREEN, Jr.; STEVEN GRIMMER; ANGEL GUERRA; RAY GUERRERO; CESAR GUITNON; ROSALINDA GUTIERREZ; RAY HALLENBECK; MICHAEL HILL; PETER

11

HOPKINS; JOSE HURTADO; MARTHA JAIME; JESSE JAMES; RICKY JOHNSON; DANNY JONES; STANLEY KANE; WILLIAM KIPP; DAVID KONG; DAVID KRUMER; HERMAN LANDRY, Sr.; GARY LEFFEW; JAMES LENOUE; JERRY LIGGETT; HIPOLITO LIZARRAGA; THOMAS LO; RICHARD LOCKETT; RUSSELL LONG; ROBERT LOPEZ; MICHAEL LORENZ; CHRISTOPHER LUNA; FRANCISCO MACIAS; GERARDO MADERA; BRIAN MALNERITCH; JOSEPHINE MAPSON; AUGUSTO MARIANO; ROBERT MARTIN; JIMMY MARTINEZ; DAWN-AMBER MCCALLUM; VICTOR MEDRANO; GEORGE MEJIA; GINA MEZA; JAVIER MONTENEGRO; MICHAEL MORALES; TIMOTHY MORRIS; ERNESTO MUNOZ; ALEJANDRO NAVA; DAVID NUNEZ; LEROI O'BRIEN; MARIO ONTIVEROS, Jr.; DAVID ORTIZ; GREGORY ORTIZ; KAREN OWENS; MARIO PARRILLO; CHRISTOPHER PATERSON; SCARLETT PATERSON; NEAL PETERSON; CLINTON POPHAM II; ERI POSS; ALEXANDER POZO; JAMES QUINLAN; CARLOS QUINTERO; JEFF QUINTON; ROGELIO RAMIREZ; MARIO RAMIREZ, Jr.; ABE RANGEL; JOHN RAY; JAMES REDMAN; UNNEYUNG REE; JOHN RICE; DAVID RIDDICK; BERNICE RIVERA; RAYMOND ROBINSON; JUAN RODRIGUEZ; RAUL RODRIGUEZ; IGNACIO ROJAS; DAVID ROMERO; JOHN ROYSDEN; MATTHEW SAENZ; JOSE SALCEDO; PETER SANCHEZ; JUAN SANTOS; ERNIE SCHOOP;

12

MICHAEL SEGUIN; HENRY SERVIN; KERRY SUPRENANT; ROBERT TAKANASHI; RICHARD TAMEZ; DAVID TAVIZON; MIGUEL TERRAZAS; WILLARD THOMASON; MICHAEL VALENCIA; PAUL VALENCIA; KENNETH VAN HOOSER II; PETER VASQUEZ, Jr.; ALEXANDER VILLALPANDO; MARCO VILLANUEVA; IVAN VINTIMILLA; WALLACE WALL; ROGER WATSON; SHELDON WILLIAMS; FRED YAMAMOTO; KRISTEN YEAGER; MANUEL



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

ZAPATA; JASON ZAPATKA; DALE ZIESMER,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

KEVIN STUDY,

Appellant,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

RICARDO ACOSTA, No. 15-55964

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05690-R-AJW and

JOSEPH ADRAGNA; ALFONSO ALFARO; CHRISTOPHER ALLEN; JAMES MARK ARENAS;
SAMUEL ARNOLD; DAVID ASHLEY; JOHN

13

AYALA; MATTHEW BAKOTICH; BRET BANACHOWSKI; SONIA BANUELOS; MICHAEL BARRIOS; MORRIS BATTS; THOMAS BERGREN; LOLITA BERMUDEZ; ROBERT BERMUDEZ; LUIS BONILLA; DEL BOURGEOIS; TIM BRANLEY; JEROME CALHOUN; JOHN CALZADA; CHRISTOPHER CAMPAGNA; ROBERT CANIZALES; ANDRES CARDENAS; RUBEN CARDENAS; RICHARD CARNEY; MEDRADO CARRANZA; JAMES CARROLL; MATTHEW CASALICCHIO; MICHAEL CHAPMAN; MARK RENE CHAVEZ; MARK CLEARY; PAUL CLEMENTS; ELVA COATS; ROBERT COATS; ANTHONY COLE; ISMAEL CONTRERAS; DAVID CRAIG; ERIC CROSSON; JUAN CRUZ; MARIO CUBILLO; MARYANN CULPEPPER; MATTHEW CUNDIFF; KEITH DAVIS; JAMAL DAWOULDI; SALVATORE DE BELLA; GREGORIO DE LA ROSA; JOSE DELGADO; BRETT DEOLOVEIRA; COREY DILLARD; ANDRE DIXON; CHERI DOOLITTLE; WILLIAM DRIVER; ARTHUR DURAN; CATHERINE DURANT; MELVIN DURANT; MICHAEL ESTRADA; JESSE ESTRADA, Jr.; PAUL FEDYNICH; GARY FERRATO; DOMINICK FUENTES; GILBERTO GAXIOLA; RUDY GONZALEZ; JONATHAN GOODE; ARTHUR GREIN; STEVE GRIMES; RICHARD GUROLLA; BENJAMIN GUTIERREZ; JORGE GUTIERREZ; MIGUEL GUTIERREZ; RICARDO GUTIERREZ; COREY HARMON; JAMES HARPER; NICHOLAS HARTMAN; VINCENT HENSON; JESUS

14



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

HERNANDEZ-SOTO; JOSE HERRERA; GABRIEL HOLGUIN; ALICIA HOLLENBACK; ARA HOLLENBACK; TARRIEL HOPPER; KEITH HORECZKO; CHARLES HOWARD; MARICELA IBANEZ; TREVOR JACKSON; GREGG JACOBUS; DAVID JAMIESON; LEE JENSEN; BRIAN JOACHIMSTALER; MICHAEL JOHNSON; HAL DEXTER JONES; GUY JUNEAU; EDWARD KELLOGG; JOHN KEY; CHRIS KLIEVER; MIKA KUROIWA; TIMOTHY LAI; JEANETTE LAWRENCE; STEVEN LECOURS; RODOLFO LEMOS; WILLIAM LIMTIACO; DANIEL LOGAN; DALE LOPEZ; JAMES LOPEZ; WALTER LOPEZ; DEBBIE LUKER; DAVID MANNING; LOUIS MARIN; MARIA MARQUEZ; CHRIS MARSHALL; JEFFREY MARTIN; REBECCA MARTIN; JOHN MARTINEZ; JORGE MARTINEZ; JULIO MARTINEZ; MARTIN MARTINEZ; DARRYL MCGREGGOR; THEADORE MCHENRY; TIMOTHY MCLAUGLIN; BEN MCPHEETERS; CHRISTOPHER MCPHEETERS; GORGONIO MEDINA, Jr.; CORY MEISNER; ERIC MELENDEZ; DANNY MENDEZ; RICHARD A. MENDOZA; OWEN MILLS; RENE MINNICK; GUILLERMO MIXER; FRANK MONTELONGO; ADAM MOORE; TYRONE MOORE; BRAD MOSSIE; MICHAEL MUNJEKOVICH; VICKIE LYN NGUYEN; BRADLEY NIELSON; CHRISTOPHER NO; SCOTT OGATA; TIM O'GORMAN; ROBERT OLMOS; JOSE PADILLA; ANDREW PAREDES; JUAN PAZ; JULIA PEAT; BRIAN PEEL;

15

JEFFREY PELCZAR; KEVIN PIERCE; ARNOLD PORTER; MARK PRAVONGVIENGKHAM; MARLON PRODIGALIDAD; MICHAEL PYTEL; EDGAR RAMOS; OSBALDO RAMOS; DAVID REDD; THOMAS REDSHAW; KYLE REMOLINO; JOSHUA RIGGS; ENRIQUE ROBLEDO; RICK RODGERS; RACHEL RODRIGUEZ; BOBBY ROMO; ALFREDO ROSALES; DAVE ROSS; NICHOLAS ROTHENMICH; JANE RUSSOM; STEVE SAINZ; ANGEL SAMBRANO; JEFFREY SANDWELL; DARREN SCIRA; NELSON SCROGGINS; DENNIS SHAW; MICHAEL SHEA; STEVEN SIEKER; ROBERT SMEY; ERNEST SPARKMAN; JAMES STOA; DANIEL SUAREZ; ART TALAMANTE; ANTHONY TEJADA; DAVID TELLO; OFELIA TELLO; MARC TESSIER; MICHELLE THOMAS; KURT THURSTON; STEPHANIE TULLER; STEPHEN UNDERWOOD; JEFFREY VACH; CARLOS VALDEZ; JAVIER VARGAS; RUBEN VEGA; STEVE VERA; GARY VERGE; ALDWIN VICENCIO; PAUL VON LUTZOW; ANGIE WHETSTONE; THOMAS WILLERS; FRED WILLIAMS; DOREEN WILSON; STEPHEN WILSON; ANDRE WRIGHT; TIMOTHY WUNDERLICH; ARTURO YANEZ; STEVEN ZABY; RAMON ZEPEDA,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

16



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

Defendant-Appellee.

RUBEN ARELLANO, No. 15-55965

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05638-R-AJW and

EVANURY AROCHO; SAMUEL BRIGGS; ROBERT CASIMIRO; KAROLIN CLARK; PHILIP CLARK; EFREN CORRAC; CHAD COSTELLO; THERESA COYLE; ROBERT CRUPI; ANGEL DOMENECH; TELLY EPPERSON; ERNEST ESKRIDGE; BENEDICT FERNANDES; TRASIA FIGUEIRA; JOHN GOMPERZ; ENRIQUE GUTIERREZ; RUBEN GUTIERREZ; JENNIFER HAMMER; SIDNEY HODGES; RICHARD KRYNSKY; CARLOS LOZANO; MATTHEW MAGSADIA; ANTONIO MARTIN; PHILLIP MILLER; PERRY MOORE; JEFFREY MULHEIM; SCOTT MURACHVER; GARY NANSON; SEASON NUNEZ; ERIC OBRECHT; MICHAEL PARIS; MARC POOLER; BRIAN REYNOLDS; JULIE RODRIGUEZ; PHILIP RUIZ; KANDIS SCHMIDT; GEORGE SELLEH; KATHY SIMPSON; ESTHER VASQUEZ; DEAN WATTS; PAUL WAYMIRE,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

17

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

EFREN ACOSTA, No. 15-55966

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05682-R-AJW and

PETER ACOSTA; RENE ACOSTA; TONY ADLER; ARTHUR ANTONIO; JORGE ARELLANO; ALEJANDRO ARREDONDO; RICHARD ASKEW; SIAMONE BANGPHRAXAY; CYNTHIA BARLOW; KARL BARNHART; PATRICK BEIGHLEY; PEDRO BENAVIDES; DAVID BENIOFF; JOHN BIGRIGG; CHRISTOPHER BLANKENSHIP; ALAN BONE; JEFFEREY BOOKER; GEORGE BOWENS, Jr.; MARVIN BRENT; CHIQUITA BROWN; RICKY BROWN; CHRISTINE BULICZ; KENNETH BUSCARINO; TODD CARPENTER; PHILLIP CARR; SAUL CARRILLO; OSVALDO CASTILLO; VIRGIL CASTOR; ANGELO CASTRO; GEORGE CASTRO; ANGEL CERVANTES; HOWARD CHAN; KEVIN CHAPPLE; DAVID CHUNG; CHRISTOPHER CLARK; DENNIS CLIFFORD; PEDRO CORDERO, Jr.; RANDALL CORDOBES; KEVIN COTTER; HURLEY CRINER; ANDRES CRUZ; TIMOTHY DACUS; DEWAYNE DAVIS; FRANCISCO DOMINGUEZ; JEREMY DUNCAN; TONY EUYOQUE; NATHAN EWERT;



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

18

VICTOR FAIN; MATTHEW FLEMING; ALFREDO FLORES; ROBERT FULLER; BRIAN GAN; JOHN GIDOWSKI; MICHAEL GOLDSTEIN; TOM GRACEY; DANIEL GREGG; GREGORY HANCOCK; WILLIAM HEIDER; ALAN HENRY; HILTON HENRY; ELVIS HERNANDEZ; RAMON HERNANDEZ; CHRISTINA HIGUERA; SHAUN HOLGUIN; KEVIN HOLLAND; ALEJANDRO IZQUIERDO; SALVADOR JARAMILLO; RAY JETER; BRENT JOHNSON; LARRY JOHNSON; LEONARD JOHNSON; RUSSELL KILBY; JOHN KIM; JOSHUA KIM; TAI KINGI; ROLF KNUTH; SCOTT KOEGEL; ALEXANDER KORDIS; MICHEL KOZAK; CHRISTOPHER KUNZ; ANTONINO LACUNZA; LEN LAI; PETER LANDELIUS; JOHN LAWRENCE; THOMAS LEE; DENNY LEOPOLDO; DONALD LINFIELD; JOANNA LINFIELD; ANDRE LOUIS; SUZANNA LOWRY; JERRY LUCIO; RICHARD LUSKLEET; PETER MAH; ALMA MARK; CRAIG MARKEL; ADAM MATKOWSKY; GEORGE MCNEILL; GARRY MCQUEEN; DANIEL MENDOZA; DEMETRIO MENDOZA; CARLOS MERCADO; JAMES MILLER; DON MONTELIBANO; WILL MUNOZ; DENNIS NELSON; DANH NGO; MITCHELL NORLING; PATRICK O'DEA; DOUGLAS PANAMENO; ALAN PARRA; MICHAEL PAULEY; ANTHONY PEREZ; MURRELL PETTWAY; JOSEPH PEYTON; DAVID PODESTA; WILLIAM PROCTOR; TYRONE RAGLAND; RAUL RAMOS;

19

STEPHEN REDD; ANTHONY REITZ; ALEXANDER RODRIGUEZ; ROBERT RODRIGUEZ; TIMOTHY ROLSEN; GARY ROSS; ANDREW ROWE; GARY SALES; LORI SANCHEZ; JOSHUA SEWELL; JERRY SIEL; SUNTI SINGHANATE; DEREK SLEDGE; ORLANDO SMITH; PATRICK SMITH; STEVEN SMITH; CHRISTOPHER SMYTHE; GLORIA SNIPES; HEIDI STOECKLEIN; VINCENT STROWAY; ROBIAN TANGO; JOSEPH TAYLOR; MICHAEL TOMELLOSO; EDUARDO TRINIDAD; MARIE TUCKER; GERARDO VASQUEZ; JAMES WALLACE; RAY WEBB; RICHARD WELLS; ROBERT WILLIAMSON; MITCHEL WINDSOR; MERITA WOODLE; DOUGLAS WORKMAN; DAVID WREN; CHUN YIM; RANDY YOSHIOKA; FRANK C. MONTELONGO,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

ROY AGBANAWAG, No. 15-55969



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05649-R-AJW and

MICHAEL AMADO; ERIC BIXLER; ROBERT CHAVIRA; MATTHEW

20

CLYMER; JOHN COOK; LAURA COOK; FRED DE LA CERDA; DANIEL DEL VALLE; CYNTHIA DRAGUN; GABRIEL FERRERAS; ISAAC GALVAN; MAURICIO GARCIA; RANDALL GARRETT; AMIE GUARDADO; THOMAS GUSTAFSON; SPLENDORA HADNOT-RICKS; MICHAEL HALL; GINGER HARRISON; DIANE HAWKING; MARIA HEISSEL; SUSAN HEROLD; PATRICK HIGA; ELEANOR HILL; ROBERT HOLCOMB; SAMNAL HONG; DAVID JAVIER; ERIC JOHNSON; CHARLES JOSEPH; JOHN JUAREZ; MICHAEL JUDGE; TIMOTHY KOHL; CRAIG KOJIMA; KENNETH KUNTUZOS; KENNETH LEWIS; ROBERT LUNA; DONALD MAGERS; HOWARD MATHEWS; RENEE MCALONIS; JOSUE MERIDA; ADRIAN MOODY; IGNACIO MURILLO; MARIA MURO; VINCENT NEGLIA; EMIGDIO NERI; SCOTT NUNEZ; JAMES ONTHANK, Jr.; MICHAEL PELLETIER; NELSON RAMAYA; PATRICK RIMKUNAS; LUIS RODARTE; GABE RODRIGUEZ; LUIS SANTIAGO, Jr.; RICHARD SAUER; ROBERT SCHLESINGER; KIT STAJCAR; RYAN VERNA; JASON WESLEY; LARRY WRIGHT,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

21

MARK ARAGON, No. 15-55974

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05631-R-AJW and

ANTHONY ARES; CHERYL ARMOUR; MICHAEL BELOUD; FELIPE BENAVIDES, Jr.; RAYMOND BROKER; PEDRO CABUNOC; LEONARD DRAYTON; PETER DURHAM; DAVID ESCOTO; MANUEL ESQUEDA; SCOTT FAIRCHILD; RAPHAEL FERRER; LESTER FREEMAN; LAURA GERRITSEN; ROBERT GRANT III; ROBERT HARRIS; PAUL HONG; TAREK ISMAIL; MATT JACOBK; CARLTON JETER; ERIC JONES; CORINNE MALINKA; DAVID MASCARENAS; JAMIE MCBRIDE; CHRISTOPHER MERRIN; JUSTIN MUDGETT; JOSEPH NAPOLITANO; MIGUEL NUNEZ; STEVE NUNEZ; ARLENE PADILLA; DONTAE PHILLIPS; RUDY QUINTANILLA; DANIEL ROBINSON; KENNETH ROBINSON; GEORGE ROCK IV;



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

RODNEY RODRIGUEZ; DANIEL SCHMIDT; JERAMIE SCHULZE; GIL SERAFIN; MATTHEW STUART; DEREK SYKES; VINCENT VICARI; LUKE WALDEN; RICHARD WALL; ANGELA WITTMAN; ERICK YEPES,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

22

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Manuel L. Real, District Judge, Presiding

DINO ANGELO, No. 15-56324

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05696-RGK-JC and

WARNER CASTILLO; DAVID DIMEGLIO; HUGO FANFASSIAN; SHELLY GALLEGOS; LIFERNANDO GARCIA; LEONARD PEREZ; DANNY ROMAN; LISA WERNLI; WILLIAM YARBROUGH; SCOTT BROWN; THERESA STANFORD; ROBERT VANINA,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

TERESA ALONZO, No. 15-56325

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05636-RGK-JPR and

PERRY ALVAREZ; JOHN AMMONS;

23



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

STEVEN ANGULO; RUDY AVELAR; LEAH BAXTER; GARY BEAN; DAVID BERUMEN, Jr.; CHARLES BLOMELEY; JENNIFER BLOMELEY; ADRIANA BRAVO; ELLEN CAMERON; JOHN CARAVEO; LORNA CAVIN; BRUCE COSS; SHAWN CRABBE; TONI DIPAOLO; SCOTT ENGEDAL; TERESA EVANS; MARIE FARRELL; VAOTUPUA FEULA; SANDRA FUTAMI; BRYAN GREGSON; ANDREA GROSSMAN; DAVID HANCE; CHARLES HAWLEY; JOHN HAYES; MARGARET HENRY; TALYA HIGGS; JAROEN HITANUKULKIT; JAMIE HOGG; ERIC JOHNSON; DELANEY JONES; GERALD LEGASPI; CARI LONG; OSCAR LOPEZ; MARK MALDONADO; THOMAS MALLOY; DAVID MARTINEZ; JULIE MCLNNIS; LIAVAA MOEVAO; RAFAEL MORA; LADOCE MORRIS; MATTHEW MURRAY; STEPHEN MUSSO; SUZAN NELSON; MALIGI NUA; BORIS OLIVA; MARIA ORTA; JEREMY PACIOKOWSKI; SONNY PATSENHANN; CRISELDA PEDRO; ROGELIO PEREZ; SALLYAN PROCACCINI; BRENT RIEDERICH; ANDREA SANFILLIPPO; DANNY SHRY; ALMA SKEFICH; BRENT SMITH; PATRICIA STROUT; NICHOLAS SYSAK; SCOTT THIELMAN; MARIA TIPPET; CLEMENT TOSCANO; JOHN URBAN; DANIEL VASQUEZ; GERARDO VELASCO; EDWARD VIDAILLET; MICHAEL VILLAREAL; CHRISTIAN WECKER; EDWARD YOON; WILLIAM YOUNG; ANTONIO ZAMORA; TROY ZEEMAN,

24

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California R. Gary Klausner, District Judge, Presiding

VICTOR ACEVEDO, No. 15-56899

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05661-GHK-PJW and

EVERARDO AMARAL; ANDREAS AN; DANIEL ANDERSEN; MARK ARAGON; FRANCISCO ARREDONDO; JUAN ARROYO; JOHN AVALOS; KEITH BACON; JOHN BANUELOS; JAY BATSON; JESUS BAZAN; TODD BEHRENS; ALBERT BERTIERE; RICHARD BERTOLDO; GIOVANNI BOCCANFUSO; MICHEL BONILLA; TODD BRACHT; JASON BURCHAM; JEFFREY BURNLEY; ROBERT CALZADILLAS; BRIAN CAMPAGNA; JOSE CARIAS; CESAR CHAVEZ; BRETT CLARK; THOMAS CLEARY; WILLIAM CORONA; JAMES CRAWFORD; OSSIE CRENSHAW; EDWARD CROCKETT; ANDRES CRUZ; EDGAR CRUZ; JOSEPH CRUZ;



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

JUAN CRUZ; MARIO CRUZ; RAQUEL CRUZ; CHRISTOPHER

25

CURRY; LUCIEN DAIGLE; THOMAS DAVOREN; RUDY DE LA FUENTE; GREGORY DEBES; LUIS DELACRUZ; OSVALDO DELGADILLO; WAYNE DEVEY; ROBERT DONALDSON; CELESTE DULA; MICHAEL DUNN; AMIR ELFARRA; TANYA EPPENGER- CAMPBELL; HECTOR ESPARZA; ABEL ESTOPIN; AUSTIN FERNALD; MICHAEL FERNANDEZ; MARIO FLORES; ROGER FONTES; MICHAEL FOX; ERIC FUKUTE; PATRICIA FULLER; ERIN GABALDON; HEATHER GAGEBY; DANIEL GARCIA; GRACE GARCIA; RUBEN GARCIA; GABRIEL GAXIOLA; JOSEPH GETHERALL; GREGORY GLODERY; STEVEN GOMEZ; JUAN GONZALEZ; RIGOBERTO GONZALEZ; SEAN GONZALEZ; MICHAEL GRAHAM; STEVE GRIFFIN; DAVID GUITERMAN; JORGE GUTIERREZ; JAMES HAGERTY; HAROLD HALLIN; CHARLES HALLIBURTON; DAVID HARRISON; JOHN HATFIELD; DWAYNE HAYDEL; ERIC HERMANN; NATHAN HERNANDEZ; RYAN HICKS; PATRICK HIGA; RHONDA HOWARD; ELBERT W. HUGHES, Jr.; MARIO JACINTO; GREGORY JACKS; MARK JACKSON; PHILLIP JACKSON; HUMBERTO JAIME; RUBEN JIMENEZ; MATTHEW JONES; HAL JONES, Jr.; JAMES KAISER; TIMOTHY KALKUS; ALLEN KAMAL; JOHN KENT; MICHAEL KNOKE; ALLAN KRISH; IRMA KRISH; TRAVIS KUPKA; MITCHELL LAMBDIN; SEAN LAULE; MARK LEE; PAUL LEHMAN; JOAN LEUCK; JOHN

26

LICATA, Jr.; JOSEPH LINARES; RAFAEL LOMELI; LETICIA LOPEZ; DEANN MALTOS; MARVIN MANCIA; RAYMOND MARQUEZ; JAMES MARSHALL; DANIEL MARTIN; MICHAEL MARTINEZ; RICHARD MCCAULEY; DOUGLAS MCCOMBS; ANGELA MCGEE; MICHAEL MCLANN; CRAIG MCLAREN; TIMOTHY MCRATH; JASON MEILLEUR; ALONSO MENCHACA; MANFRED MERKENS; STEPHEN MERRIN; MICHAEL MIRACLE; BRYAN MIVELAZ; TRISHA MIVELAZ; MARJAN MOBASSER; ANDREW MOODY; CHARLES MOORE; ALBERT MORA; JOSEPH MUELLER; ABEL MUNOZ; ALVARO NAVARRO; JOANNA NEEDHAM; BRUCE NELSON; MINH NGUYEN; JAMES NOSS; DAVID NUNN; RICHARD OKE; LEONARDO OLEA; RICARDO OLIVA; ADAM O'NEILL; OSCAR ONTIVEROS; MICHAEL OPPELT; DONALD ORNELAS; ANTHONY ORTIZ; MONILACKTENA OUAHDI; DANA OVIATT; YOUNG PAK; ROSEANNE PARINO; JUAN PEREIDA; EDUARDO PEREZ; LEE PERRY; DAVID PETERSEN; JOSEPH POLLACK; RAUL PORRAS; RYAN POWELL; FRANK PRECIADO; WARREN PULLEY; HUY QUACH; JAMES QUINONES; ANTONIO RAMIREZ; ROLAND RAMIREZ; PEDRO REYES; ROBIN RICHARDS; PABLO RIVERA; JACK III RIZZOTTO; ERWIN ROCHA; RICK RODGERS; JOAQUIN RODRIGUEZ, Jr.; HENRY ROMERO; TIMOTHY RUIZ; MANUEL RUMION; DAVID SABEDRA; DARRELL SANCHO;

27



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

ROGELIO SANDOVAL; DARRELL SANOMO; BRAIN SCHMIDER; MICHAEL SCHNEIDER; PAUL SCIARRILLO, Jr.; DARYL SCOGGINS; RUTHANN SCOTT; TERRI SCOTT; ROCKY SHERWOOD; JOHN SHIN; CESAR SILVA; DONALD SINGER; ANTHONY SMITH; EUGENE SMITH; KAREN SMITH; JESSE SOLTERO; GREGORY SOUTHERN; FRANCINE SPADA; JEFFREY SPANGLER; SVEN STEFFENSEN; ANGELO STEWART; JEFFREY STEWART; JODY STIGER; SHAD STILKEY; THOMAS STONE; PATRICIA SUAREZ; JONATHAN SUGAR; RICHARD SUVIATE; JAMES SWIFT III; FABIO TAGLIERI; JOHN TALBOT; GERARDO TERRAZAS; PHILIP THOMPSON; JOSEPH YAMZON; JAIME ZARATE; JAMES THORNTON; PEGGY THUSING; CHARLES TIZANO; EMILY TOMLIN; PEDRO TORRES; TIMOTHY TOTH; FREDERICK TREDY TREDY; ANGELA TRIMINO; JACK TUCK; BRIAN TYNDALL; ADAN URENA; ONAM URENA; CHARLES URSO; MIGUEL VACA; MIGUEL VALLEJO; RITA VALLEJO; RAYMOND VALOIS; FELIPE VASQUEZ; ELIZABETH VEASCO; PIERRE VIEILLEMARIN; D. MICHELE VROLYKS; JUDE WASHINGTON; DONNA WATKINS; GARY WELLER; STANLEY WIEDENHAUPT; TIMOTHY WIENCKOWSKI; SHELBY WILCOX; SCOTT WILHELM; CLARENCE WILLIAMS; MATTHEW WILLIAMS; MICHAEL WILLIAMS; TROY WILLIAMS; DEBRA WINTER; JOE

28

WITTY; JOHN WONG; MICHAEL WOODINGS; MIGUEL DOMINGUEZ,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California George H. King,
District Judge, Presiding

ANDRE ABRAMS, No. 15-56949

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05646-ODW-SH and

JAMES AGNOLE; JULIO ALFONSO; EDGAR ARCA; ANDY AZODI; TODD BALDWIN; PATRICIA BLAKE; DINO CAMPODONICO; JOHN CAREY; JOSEPH CHAVEZ; DUC DAO; MANUEL DELGADO; DANIEL DRULIAS; MARY FENCL; MARC FERRIS; MICHAEL FLANNERY; ELIZABETH GUDINO; HECTOR GUZMAN; WALTER HANNA; BRIAN HARRIS; ERIC HERNANDEZ; RAYMOND HERNANDEZ; DAVID HERSKOWITZ; ALEX HOFFMASTER;



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

TODD HOLMBERG; CEDRIC INGRAM; JAMES JESTER; JOHN JIZMEJIAN; JAMES KUKKOK;
RON LAGRASSA; BONNIE LEHIGH; DAVID LIN; ROBERT LONGDON; MICHELLE LOPEZ;

29

JOSHUA LUKASZEWSKI,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Otis D. Wright II,
District Judge, Presiding

CAROLYN COWARD, No. 15-56957

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05676-DMG-JC and

JENNIE WONG; BENJAMIN AGUILERA; JORGE ALFARO; ALEXANDER ALVAREZ; JAIME
ANCHONDO; MANUEL ANDUJO; RAMON ARGUELLES; ERNEST AVILA; CARLOS AYALA;
KARLA BARRRAZA; DONALD BENDER; ANGEL BONILLA; ROBASERT BROGELMAN;
THOMAS BURRIS; MATTHEW CALLEROS; GUSTAVO CAMACHO; DAVID CARBAJAL;
EDWARD CASTRO; RUDY CHAVEZ; JUAN CONTRERAS; JOHN CORDOVA; VICTOR
CORRAL; VINCENT CORREA; DOMINIC COUNTS; OMAR DAVIS; MARK DIMITT; FRANK
DOMINGUEZ III; SHAWN DUKE; NELSON ENAMORADO; JAMES FERRELL;

30

JANETTE FLORES; SALVADOR FLORES; WERNER FLORES; MARIO GAMEZ; LEONARD
GARZA; GARZA OSCAR; PAVEL GOMEZ; ANNISSA HARSMA; RAFAEL HERNANDEZ;
HECTOR IBARRA; PETER JACK; ANDREW LASSAK; SALVADOR LIZARRAGA; DAVID LOREA;
FRANK LOPEZ II; LOUIS LOZANO; RAYMOND MADRID; DAVID MANRIQUEZ; LAWRENCE
MARTINEZ; PATRICK MARMOLEJO; ACKLEY MAYER- TUCKER; RAMON MEJIA; PAUL
MENCHACA; VICTOR MENCAS; RALPH MENDOZA; MATTHEW MENESES; WILLIAM
MONAHAN; MARIO MORALES; STEVE MORALES; PAUL MOSLEY; JEFFRI NORAT;
SCARLETT NUNO; EUGENE OLEA; LARRY OLIANDE; CARLOS OLMOS; JASON PEDRO;
JOEL PEREZ; HYONG PERKINS; MARTHA PLATA; JOHN PORRAS; JOE QUEZADA; ALONSO



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

RAMIREZ; ANTHONY RAZO; ROY REZA, Jr.; RUDOLPH RIVERA, Jr.; CHRISTOPHER RODRIGUEZ, Jr.; RONNIE ROMERO; JOSE ROMO; SERGIO SALAS; JOSE SALAZAR; ROBERT SCUTARU; MANUEL SEGURA; EDWARD SILVA; JUAN SILVA; DAVID SOLIS; MICHAEL SULLIVAN; JAE SUNG; BENJAMIN TRAN; GREGORY TREJO; JOSE VAZQUEZ; GERARDO VEJAR; RICARDO VERDUZCO; ALFONSO VILLANEDA; RUFUS WARD III; SHON WELLS; ERIC WILLIAMS; GUADALUPE RUIZ; GEORGE WILSON; MICHAEL YORO; JUAN ZARATE; JUAN ZAVALA;

31

JUAN ZENDEJAS,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Dolly M. Gee, District Judge, Presiding

RANDOLPH AGARD, No. 15-56959

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05668-PSG-JC and

DEEN ALCARAZ; FRANCISCO BANUELOS; BYRON BARNES; GEORGE BASHAI; PAUL BERND; JOHN BLONDO; CARLTON BROWN; NINA BROWN; ROBIN BROWN; KENNETH CABRERA; RAMIRO CABRERA; ERIC CAMPOS; CAMERON CARRILLO; ROBERT CELAYA; HECTOR CHAIDEZ; SAMUEL CHO; KELLY CLARK; EUGENE COLEMAN; KEELY COLEMAN; JOSE COVARRUBIAS; JORGE CRUZ; JOHN DAVIS; ALBERTO DEL VALLE; DONNI ELLISON; JEREMY ESCAMILLA; JOHN FLORES; JACKIE FORT; OMAR FRANCO; RICHARD GABALDON; BRIAN GINGRAS; STEPHEN GLICK; MARLON GOMEZ; JOSEPH GONZALEZ; OSVALDO

32

GONZALEZ; RICHARD GORDON; PAMELA GREEN; SEAN HANSEN; DARREN HILL; ENRICO HIZON; ERIC HOLYFIELD; THEODORE JARA; TERRY JOHNS; LISA KELLY; PAUL LAWSON; STEVEN LEMMER; JEFFREY LEU; ERNEST LONDON; MIGUEL LOPEZ; LOUIS LAZANO;



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

RUZANNA LULEDZYAN; RYAN MARSHALL; MICHAEL MARTINEZ; RAY MARTINEZ; ASATUR MKRTCHYAN; ARMANDO MONARREZ; JAMES MOON; ROBERT MURRAY; DENNIS NGUYEN; TRACIE NOGGLE; ELOY OCHOA; PIERRE OLEGA; OSCAR ORDONEZ; CESAR OROZCO; CARLOS ORTEGA; JOSE ORTEGA; JOSEPH PUDELWITTS; RICK RAFTER; RYTIS RAZANSKAS; VALENTIN REYES; DONALD RICHARDS; JOHN RICHARDSON; JONATHAN ROMAN; SUNNY SASAJIMA; JERITT SEVERNS; STACEY SEYMKOWIAK; JAIME SMERDEL; JACOB SNOW; CARLOS SUTTON; CARL TAYLOR; BRIAN THAYER; MALCOLM THOMAS; RAFAEL TOBAR; CEDRIC WASHINGTON; JULIUS WELLS II; RYAN WHITEMAN; ERNEST WILLIAMS; SAMUEL WILLIAMS, Jr.; BRIAN ZAVALA,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

33

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Philip S. Gutierrez, District Judge, Presiding

BENNY ABUCEJO, No. 15-56960

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05666-GW-MRW and

MARIO AGUILAR; PHILLIP ALANIZ, Jr.; DENOS AMARANTOS; PAUL AVILA; PATRICIA BATTS; TAMARA BAUMANN; ELIZABETH BOCCANFUSO; CHRISTOPHER BORUNDA; KRISTI BRANDON; MARYANN BUNAG; TODD BURNS; PETER CABRAL; JOSE CARIAS; WARNER CARIAS; GEORGE CHAVEZ; WOON CHONG; RICKEY CROWDER, Jr.; TRAVIS CURTIN; DARRYL DANAHER; GERARDO DAVILA; THOMAS DAWSON; SEAN DEMPSEY; JOSE DIAZ-IBARRA; KEVIN DUNIGAN; RICARDO FERIA; OSCAR GAMINO; CHARLES GARCIA; JESUS GARCIA; SONNY GARCIA; CHRIS GIARGIARI; GERALD GIBSON; RANDY GOENS; FRANCISCO GONZALEZ; JAMES GRACE; JOSHUA CHONG; CARMEN GUTIERREZ; ENRIQUE HERNANDEZ; BENJAMIN HETZLER; CHARLES HICKS; MELL HOGG; ERIC HOLGUIN; ERIC JENNINGS; DANNY JIMENEZ; CHRISTOPHER JORDAN; ROBERT KNIGHT; RICHARD LARSON, III; PETER LEE; ALAN LITTLE; ANTHONY LOPEZ; RICHARD LOPEZ; CARLOS

34



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

LOZANO; SANDRA MAGDALENO; STEVEN MARIN; GABRIEL MARTINEZ; ROBERT MARTINEZ; SHAWN MASSEY; KEVIN MCNAMEE; MARK MIRAGLIA; DEAN MONTELEONE; STEVEN MUIRHEAD; MICHAEL O'CONNOR; GIL PADILLA; JONATHAN PASILLAS; ANTONIO PEREZ; CATARINO PEREZ; FLORO PINZON; PETER PONICH; RICARDO RIVERA; PATRICK ROMAN; RICHARD ROMNEY; CHRISTIAN RUEDA; MARCELO SABBATELLA; MICHAEL SAGHERA; SERGIO SANCHEZ; MANUEL SIERRA; MICHAEL SMERDEL; CATHERINE SOBIESKI; FRED STARKEY; DARREN STAUFFER; JAMES STERLING; SCOTT TEUBERT; RITCHIE TIJERINA; JONATHAN TIPPET; CARLOS TORRES; JAMES TOWNSEND, II; MARCO VARGAS; PETER VERSCHUEREN; SHERWIN VIGILANT; OSCAR VILLARREAL; SCOTT VOSTAD; EARL WILLIAMS; JAMES WILLIAMS; ROBERT WORRALL; ROBERT YANEZ; ROBERTO YANEZ; JOHN ZAMBRI,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California George H. Wu, District Judge, Presiding

35

GUADALUPE ALANIZ, No. 15-56961

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05658-PSG-MRW and

ALAN ALDERGARIE; ROBERT ARELLANO; HECTOR ACEVES; ASHUR AGENA; DAVID AIKINS; TERESA AKUNE; MANUEL ALVAREZ; MICHAEL APODACA; RAYNEY ARNOLD; NESTOR AYSON; EZEQUIEL BARRAZA; DAVID BAMBRICK; RALPH BARONE; NADYA BENNYWORTH; LONNIE BENSON; MICHAEL BLAKE; BARRY BLOCKER; PAUL BOWSER; LANE BRAGG; TODD BRIDGES; LONYA BRITTON; BARRY BROOKS; BLAKE BUDAI; DAVID BURRUS; IAN CARBONELL; MIKE CASETTA; SOPHIA CASTANEDA; JUAN CEJA; JING CHAO; ANDREW CHAPPLE; JEFF CHIANTARETTO; PAUL CHOUNG; JOHN CHRISPENS; JOSEPH CRUZ; JOSEPH CURTIS; RONALD DE WYKE; JAMES DICKSON; ROBIN DOWNEY; YOLANDA ECHOLS; VICTOR EGUEZ; JAMES ELDRIDGE; ALICIA ELLIOTT; JOHN ENOS; MICHELLE ESKRIDGE; MARTIN ESPINOZA; ROBERT ESPINOZA; GUY FALTINOWSKI; ADRIAN FERNS; ARLDWIN FLORES; KEN FURUTA; ANDREW GALLAGHER; LISETTE GARCIA; MARCELA GARCIA; THOMAS GARCIA; CAESAR GONZALEZ; LISA GROPP; TRACI



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

GRUNDLAND; ROBERT GUERVARA; JOHN HANKINS; MUSTAFA

36

HASSANZAI; FRANK HIGADERA; ROBERT HILLARD, Jr.; DAMON HOGAN; MARICELA HUERTA; MICHAEL HUFF; KENNETH HURLEY; WORAVOTH IDDHIBHAKDIBONGSE; MANUEL IBARRA; WILLIAM JOYCE; ELLIOTT KING; TAEWOOK KIM; DENNIS LADA; MARK LAUERDALE; WALTER LEIVA; HEIDI LLANES; DARIUS LEE; HSIN-YI LO; ADAM LOO; PETER LOPEZ; KEVIN LOWE; BARBARA LYDEN; ANTHONY MAGDALENO; JAMES MANKEY; ARTURO MARES; MARLON MARRACHE; GUSTAVO MARTINEZ; RAMON MARTINEZ; RUBEN MARTINEZ; KEVIN MASON; TINA MATSUSHITA; DARELL MATTHEWS; RONALD MCNALLY; JEFF MERLO; RAY MORENO; ROGER MORGAN; JOSEPH MORRISON; RICHARD MOSSLER; MARCO MUNOZ; STEPHEN NASSIEF; LUIS NAVARETTE; DAVID NAVAS; JEFF NELSON; EMERY NEWSOM; SHELDON NICHOLSON; DWIGHT NOLAN; DANNY ODOM; GUADALUPE PALOMARES; STEVEN PARK; RICHARD PARKS; RANDY PETERSON; MANUEL PEREZ; VICTOR PEREZ; WILLIAM PEREZ; LUIS PINELL; MARK POMPARO; JAMES POON; KENNETH PRICE; GREGORY PROBST; BOBBY RAMERO; MARK RAMIREZ; ANTHONY RAMOS; RICHARD RAMOS; KIMBERLY RATLIFF; CHRISTINA REPPUCCI; MICHAEL REX; JAMES RIVERA; TERI ROBINSON; KATHY RODITIS; ANTONIO RODRIGUEZ; CHARLES RODRIGUEZ; JOHN

37

RODRIGUEZ; RODRIGO RODRIGUEZ; KRISTOPHER ROLLINS; DAVID ROSENTHAL; JIM ROSSUM; KARENA ROWAN; RAMIRO RUEZGA; TERRY SALEONO; DON SASAKI; STEPHEN SHOWLER; STANLEY SCHOTT; MONEY SCOTT; BRODIE SEAGRAVE; ANTONIA SERNA; JONATHAN SMITH; WILLIAM SNOWDEN; ANTHONY SOLIS; BRUCE STALLWORTH; DAVID STIRLING; CHARLES STRONG; KELLY SULLIVAN; SHIHKUO SUN; MICHAEL SWITZER; MARSTON TAYLOR; ALEX TELLEZ; JOSEPH TERENA; RAYMOND TERRONES; MICHAEL THOMPSON; JEFFREY TIFFIN; EDWARD TSAI; ROBERT VALENCIA; MAURICIO VARGAS; ROBERT VASQUEZ; ANTONIO VASQUEZ; RALPH VINCENT; ROBERT WADE; CHRISTOPHER WALKER; TIM WALTERS; RONALD WEAVER; GREGORY WHITE; THOMAS WICKS; ISAAH WILLIAMS; SUSAN WILLIS; CHRISTINE WYCOFF; RAYMOND YGUAL; KRISTAN ZALOKAR,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Philip S. Gutierrez, District Judge, Presiding

38

HORACIO AGUIRRE, No. 15-56962

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05659-CBM-SS and

MICHAEL ALEXANDER-FULLER; GREG ANDRACHICK; JASON ARMENDARIZ; THOMAS BIBBS; DAVID BRANDSLETTER; RALPH BROWN; GREG BRUCE; OSCAR CANSINO; SILVIA CORRAL; TODD COSTELLO; DAVID CUETO; NEAL FINE; JOE FLORES; CHARLES J. GARCIA; RUDY GONZALES; IVAN GUILLERMO; WILLIAM GUTIERREZ; DAVID HAM; DENNIS HAMMONDS; MICHAEL HARRINGTON; ADAM HOLLANDS; TIMOTHY HOPE; FLORENCE JOHNSON; STEVEN JOHNSON; STEVEN JUAREZ; RAFFI KHANDIKIAN; JAIME KIRCHOFF; ALAN KREITZMAN; TIMOTHY LEDINGHAM; ANDY LEURIDAN; EDGAR MAGAT; WILLIAM MARBLEY; SALVADOR MARTINEZ; BRYAN MILLNER; VALENTIN MONTESDEOCA; KENNETH MOORE; LISA MOORE-CRAWFORD; STACEY MORRIS; DEREK MOUSSEAU; MICHAEL PAVELKA; DAVID PERRY; TERESA PIKOR; RICHARD PRINDLE; BERNARD PULLIAM; JUAN REYES; DAVID SALCEDO; DARRELL SANCHO; BRADLEY SCHUMACHER; WILLIAM SIMONOFF; VICTOR SUAPAIA; VAN THOMPSON; BRANDON TUCCILLO; JOSE VERDIN; RONALD VON GOBER; TREVOR ZIEMBA,

39

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Consuelo B. Marshall, District Judge, Presiding

ROGER ARCHAMBAULT, No. 15-56963

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05660-FMO-VBK and



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

FRANK BANCALARI; MARTIN BAROCIO; ANDRE BAYDALINE; RANDAL BOWMAN; FRED BRIGNONI; HECTOR CARBAJAL; DANIEL CHILSON; JIMMY CHOI; STEVEN COHEN; CRISTOPHER CORTIJO; TIMOTHY CRABTREE; MARK CRONIN; SAMUEL DAVIS; RALPH EMARD; DAVID FATOOL; MARIO FIGUEROA, Jr.; GREGORY FUQUA; DOUG GALLAHER; TIMOTHY GALLICK; GEORGE GOODYEAR; STEVE GRIFFITH; MARK GUARDADO; RONALD HARRELL; DARRELL HINSON; DAVID HOPKINS; ANTHONY HOTCHKISS; DAVID HOVEY; JAMES HUTCHINS; YOUNG JHEON; LAWRENCE JONES; WILLIAM JUSTICE; ALAN KAMAL; BRIAN

40

KELLY; RICHARD KNOFF; GONZALO LARA; CONNOR MACLVOR; FELICIA MCADAMS; CLAUDIA MENDOZA; LUZ MONTERO; TIM OLSEN; JAMES PANEK; STEVEN RAUSCH; BRETT ROBINSON; WILLIAM ROMANELLI; KRISTINE SALAZAR; PAUL SKINNER; PHILLIP TATE; WILLIAM TATUM; BRYCE Verna; RAYMOND VILLALOBOS; SUZANNE VUKOVIC; ROBERT WEISZ; EDWARD WHEELIS; MARK WHITE; ROBERT WHITE; ANGELA WIENCKOWSKI; KIM WONG; TERESA ZUNDEL,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Fernando M. Olguin, District Judge, Presiding

JUAN AGUILAR, No. 15-56964

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05633-PSG-JC and

STEVEN AGUILAR III; MARK ALLEN; JUAN AMANCIO; MARLENE AREGUELLO; VICTOR ARELLANO; DAVID ARMAS; RALPH ARZATE; ARNEL ASUNCION; MIGUEL

41

BARAJAS; JEFFREY BEACHAM; LEROY BLOCK; OSCAR CASTELLANOS; ARTHUR CASTRO; JUAN CHAVEZ; GINA CHO VAN; YA MAY CHRISTLE; JOHN CUENCA; CURTIS DAVIS; RICHARD DAVIS; LENNING DAVIS III; GARY EAGLESON; KELLY EDWARDS; LANITA



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

ELIAS; PAUL ESPINOZA; DEBORAH FETTERS; CARLOS FIGUEROA; JOE GALINDO; LISA GALLEGOS; GILBERT GARCIA; KEVIN GIBERSON, Jr.; MIKE GILBERT; CONSUELO GONZALEZ; JAIME GONZALEZ; ROBERT GONZALEZ; KEITH GREEN; WAYNE GUILLARY; YOUNG HONOR, Jr.; BRENT HOULIHAN; ERIC HURD; JEAN JIMENEZ; TERRY KEEFER; KENNETH KOCH; ANTHONY KONG; WILLIAM LARKIN; DANIEL LEE; ROBERT LONA, Jr.; MICHAEL LOPEZ; RONALD LOPEZ, Sr.; GERARDO LOZA; DAN MCCOOLE; DAVID MCDOWELL; RICHARD MERCADO; KIMBERLY MOLE; KENNETH MONTAGUE; RENE MORALES; REGINA NARES; FERNANDO OCHOA; DANIEL OSOH; HECTOR OLIVERA; JEREMY OLSEN; DONG PARK; KULIN PATEL; GILBERT PEDREGON; LEO PEREZ; LISA PHILLIPS; ANNETTE POTTS; OSCAR PRADO; MICHAEL QUEZADA; LEONARD RAMIREZ; RODOLFO RAMIREZ; RAYMOND RANGEL; LEOPOLDO REY; LUIS REYES; ARTHUR REYNA; DANIEL RIOS; GABRIEL RIVAS; PATRICK ROINSON; LUIS ROBLES; MARCO RODRIGUEZ;

42

JAIME ROUSSETT; SERGIO RUEDAS; SAM SALAZAR; ROBERTO SAN ROMAN; JESSE SANCHEZ; VERONICA SAUCEDO; CHRIS SCOTT; MICHAEL SOLIS; SUSAN SOLLEY; WILLIAM SPRINGER; JOHN STASNER; SONG SUH; ERIK SUNDSTROM; OFELIA TELLO; WARREN TOJONG; GREGORY TREVINO; JULIO UMANA; CHRISTOPHER VASQUEZ; REX WELLS; THEODORE WILLIAMS; RAYMOND WONG,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Philip S. Gutierrez, District Judge, Presiding

ISMAEL ALDAZ, Sr., No. 15-56967

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05642-CAS-SS and

MARIBEL ARAMBULA; EDDIE BADILLO; JOYCE BANUELOS; OMAR CEDRE; CECILIA CLEVELAND; MERRI DALLAS; STEVEN EGUCHI; JAMES ERWIN III; MAYDA ESPINOZA; ROBERT FERNANDEZ; JOHN GARCIA; JACK GIROUD; PAUL GLASCOW;

43



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

CHERYL GONZALEZ; JIMMY GRAYSON; DAVID HARRIS; CRYSTAL HAYES; GERARDO HERNANDEZ; RAYMOND HERNANDEZ; RICHARD HOEFEL; RICKY ISHITANI; LEANN JONES; THOMAS KIRK; JERRY KOWALSKY; ANTONIO LOPEZ, Jr.; RICHARD LUGO; JEFF MARES; CHRISTOPHER MARTINEZ; ORLANDO MARTINEZ; RAYMOND MAUSS; GERALD MEARS; DANIEL MENDOZA; LEZABETT MESA; JOHN MORENO; JEFF NOLTE; MICHAEL OZAKI; STACY PIERCE-ROGERS; RICHARD PLOWS; ROBERT QUEZADA; EMMA RAMIREZ; RICHARD RAMIREZ, Jr.; ROBERT RIVERA; DARLENE SHELLEY; STEVEN TAKESHITA; SONYA TIEFENBACHER; ROSA TORRES; LON TROUNG; MICHAEL VALDES; ABRAHAM VIDRIEZCA,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Christina A. Snyder, District Judge, Presiding

FREDGER ALEXANDER, No. 15-56969

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05645-CBM-SS

44

and

BENNIE BOATWRIGHT; FRANCIS BOLAN; ERIC BRIGGS; RONALD CADE; MICHAEL CALHOUN; CHRISTY CHASE; CHRIS CHAVARRIA; FRANK CIEZADLO; MARCELLA COLLINS; DAVID CORDOVA; STEVEN DORSEY; JAMES EDWARDS; ROBERT FELIX; JEFFREY FISCHER; MIGUEL GOMEZ; ADAM GREEN; DESHAUN HALL; NATHANIEL HAMPTON; TONY IM; ROSCOE JOLLA; SEAN KARMODY; JEE KIM; TIMOTHY KIM; SHARON KROGER; CHRISTOPHER LANDRY; NICHOLAS LEE; GEORGE LEIVA; PEDRO LLANES; FRANCISCO LOPEZ; BRANDEN MAMROT; SEAN MCGEE; MATTHEW MCNULTY; ERIC MOLLINEDO; TAAJ MUHAMMED; GEORGIA ODOM; LEON ORTEGA; VERONICA PADILLA; EVA PERRY; BRIDGET PICKETT; LAURA PREASMYER; ARTURO RAMOS; ALFONSO REYES; SPIRO RODITIS; RUTHANN SCOTT; WILLIAM SEGEE; MAGGIE SHERMAN; DARRYL SHUM; TIMOTHY STACK; CHARLES THOMAS; MICHAEL TIRELLA; HUGO VALDEZ; SANDRA VALLE; GREGG WEBBER; FRANCOIS WISE; STEPHEN



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

YUROCHKO,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

45

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Consuelo B. Marshall, District Judge, Presiding

CAMILLE ARMSTEAD, No. 15-56973

Plaintiff, D.C. No. 2:14-cv-05675-MMM-CW and

GERRY CHAMBERLAIN; TERENCE KLAFKE; JUDITH LARSEN; ROBERTO R. LOPEZ; SANDRA LOPEZ; CATHY LUKE; JAMES LUMPKIN; ROBERT MARTINEZ; LAWRENCE MULLALY; BLANCA PASOS; MONICA QUIJANO; ESTHER REYES; GILBERT SANCHEZ; JAVIER SANCHEZ; KENNETH SANTOLLA; TIMOTHY SCHEY; YVONNE WHITEMAN,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Margaret M. Morrow, District Judge, Presiding

Argued and Submitted November 8, 2017 Pasadena, California

46

Before: LINN,** BERZON, and M. SMITH, Circuit Judges.



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

In 2004 and 2007, approximately 2,500 Los Angeles Police Department (LAPD) officers brought suit against the City of Los Angeles (the City), alleging that the City had violated the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA), 29 U.S.C. §§ 201, et seq., by failing to pay the officers for their overtime work. On May 21, 2014, District Judge Gary A. Feess granted the City's decertification motion in both cases, concluding that the officers were not "similarly situated." Sub-groups of the original collectives then instituted 28 separate lawsuits, which were assigned to 13 different district judges in the Central District of California. In every case, the City filed a motion to dismiss on the basis of misjoinder. And in every case, this motion was granted and all plaintiffs but for the named plaintiff were dismissed pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 20 and 21. The 27 instant appeals followed, and were consolidated for our review.

We have jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1291. We review a district court's resolution of a motion to dismiss for improper joinder for an abuse of discretion, see, e.g., *Cuprite Mine Partners LLC v. Anderson*, 809 F.3d 548 , 551 (9th Cir. 2015); *Coleman v. Quaker Oats Co.*, 232 F.3d 1271 , 1296-97 (9th Cir. 2000), and may affirm on any ground supported by the record, e.g., *Livid Holdings Ltd. v.*

^{**} The Honorable Richard Linn, Senior United States Circuit Judge for the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit, sitting by designation.



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

As the facts and procedural history are familiar to the parties, we decline to recite them.

Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 20 establishes the standards for permissive joinder, and Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 21 governs the remedies for misjoinder.

See *Pan Am. World Airways, Inc. v. U.S. Dist. Ct. for the Cent. Dist. of Cal.*, 523 F.2d 1073, 1079-80 (9th Cir. 1975) (directing courts to analyze the validity of permissive joinder for the purposes of Rule 21 according to Rule 20's requirements).

In relevant part, Rule 20 allows "[p]ersons [to] join in one action as plaintiffs if:

(A) they assert any right to relief jointly, severally, or in the alternative with respect to or arising out of the same transaction, occurrence, or series of transactions or occurrences; and (B) any question of law or fact common to all plaintiffs will arise in the action." Fed. R. Civ. P. 20(a)(1). Rule 21 provides that if these two criteria are not met and plaintiffs are improperly joined, "[o]n motion or on its own, the court may at any time, on just terms, add or drop a party. The court may also sever any claim against a party." Fed. R. Civ. P. 21.

Here, Plaintiffs-Appellants have failed to satisfy Rule 20's permissive joinder standard. For example, Plaintiffs-Appellants do not allege any greater connection between their claims than that the City's employees violated the FLSA in comparable ways, at various different times, and in various different divisions and

bureaus. Plaintiffs-Appellants' claims therefore are too factually disparate to arise



ROBERT ALVARADO v. CITY OF LOS ANGELES

2018 | Cited 0 times | Ninth Circuit | April 30, 2018

out of the same transaction, occurrence, or series of transactions or occurrences. See, e.g., *Visendi v. Bank of Am., N.A.*, 733 F.3d 863 , 870 (9th Cir. 2013); *Coughlin v. Rogers*, 130 F.3d 1348 , 1350 (9th Cir. 1997). Thus, no district court abused its discretion in deciding to “dismiss all but the first named plaintiff without prejudice to the institution of new, separate lawsuits by the dropped plaintiffs.” *Coughlin*, 130 F.3d at 1350.

We need not decide whether any district court improperly relied on Judge Feess’s decertification decision or any decertification discovery in reaching its decision, because we can affirm on any ground supported by the record and the record in each of these consolidated appeals supports our conclusion that the permissive joinder standard was not satisfied.

AFFIRMED.